In order to be accepted into the publication process, all HDAs must meet minimum standards. Unfortunately, this manuscript did not pass the initial review.
This is part of FPIN's Reject & Resubmit Once policy. Authors will only have one opportunity to submit their revisions for these specific issues to the editorial office for a second review. Please fix ALL of the marked items on the attached MET Review summary checklist within the next 3 weeks. Please resubmit a clean manuscript with no track changes and keep the original manuscript in the EMS. If you re-submit the manuscript without fixing all of the errors, your manuscript could be selected for permanent rejection. If you need additional time, please see FPIN's Due Date Extension Policy.

EMS Number: _____

Question:_____

Your Scores	Min. Score for Rejection
Format: _____	**1 or more**
Evidence Summary Total: _____	**5 or more**
Paragraph 1: _____	
Paragraph 2: _____	
Paragraph 3: _____	
Paragraph 4: _____	
Paragraph 5: _____	
Table: _____	**2 or more**

Managing Editor Editorial Review – Checklist

Blue superscript numbers refer to page numbers in the HDA Author Handbook providing further information

Section 1: Format

Manuscript will be rejected for any one infraction on this page

Score:_____

- Manuscript does NOT meet technical standards:
  - _____ Cover Page is incorrect page 4
    - ____ Cover Page needs to be attached as a separate document
    - ____ Author names must be present on Cover Page and removed from manuscript
    - ____ All authors must be included in the author list (including the Corresponding Author)
    - ____ The Corresponding Author must be noted separately with their email address
    - ____ The Corresponding Author listed must match the Corresponding Author in the EMS
  - _____ Author names do not match names in EMS (Note: The Corresponding Author in the EMS is required to contribute to the writing of the manuscript.)
  - _____ Question in manuscript does not match the initial invitation or is absent from the document
  - _____ Manuscript not submitted as Word document page 5
  - _____ Word count (Evidence-Based Answer and Evidence Summary) is more than 900 words

- Reference section:
  - _____ Reference does not contain evidence pertinent to the question:
    - ___ Does the patient population included in the studies closely match the patient population in the proposed question?
    - ___ Does the intervention group and the comparator group in included studies directly apply to answering the question?
    - ___ Do the measured outcomes in the included studies match the outcomes included in the proposed question and/or contribute to answering the question?
    - ___ Does the wording of the question match the studies evaluated? If not, should a question revision be suggested?
  - _____ Reference appears to be a narrative/literature review (not a systematic review)
  - _____ Has only 1 reference or more than 5 references page5
  - _____ References not numbered in order of appearance page5
  - _____ References are not attached as PDF files
  - _____ Has no STEP level indicators page 14
  - _____ Included as 'End Notes' page14

- Methods Section:
  - _____ Method section not included
  - _____ All four databases were not searched
  - _____ Text in the method section not verbatim from the template
  - _____ Information requested in brackets in the template has not been included:
    - ___ HDA question
    - ___ Brief descriptions of the patients/population, intervention/new test, comparison/reference standard, and outcomes
    - ___ Age of oldest reference
  - _____ Search terms not included in the Table

_____ Total number of records identified for each search term not included
_____ Figure (Literature Search Flow Diagram) not completed

- Evidence Summary:
  _____ More than one reference summarized in each paragraph (written in narrative review format) page 3
  _____ Citation numbers not listed page8
- Evidence Based Answer:
  _____ No EBA
  _____ EBA does not directly answer the question page 6
  _____ No SOR indicators page 6
  _____ Brief explanatory phrases missing from SOR indicators page 6

COMMENTS:

Section 2: Evidence Summary pages 7-12 | FPIN Institute Module

Manuscript will be rejected for any five (5) infractions in this section

Paragraph 1

Score:_____

- Paragraph summarizing a single study lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ number of patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement
- Paragraph summarizing a systematic review or meta-analysis lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ total number of included studies
  - _____ total number of included patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results with (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement
- Paragraph summarizing a diagnostic study (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
  - _____ description of testing protocol
  - _____ description of reference standard
  - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
  - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)
- Paragraph summarizing a practice guideline lacks:
  - _____ developing organization
  - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
  - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 2

Score:_____

- Paragraph summarizing a single study lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ number of patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a systematic review or meta-analysis lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ total number of included studies
  - _____ total number of included patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a diagnostic study (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
  - _____ description of testing protocol
  - _____ description of reference standard
  - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
  - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a practice guideline lacks:
  - _____ developing organization
  - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
  - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 3

Score:_____

- Paragraph summarizing a single study lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ number of patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement
- Paragraph summarizing a systematic review or meta-analysis lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ total number of included studies
  - _____ total number of included patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement
- Paragraph summarizing a diagnostic study (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
  - _____ description of testing protocol
  - _____ description of reference standard
  - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
  - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)
- Paragraph summarizing a practice guideline lacks:
  - _____ developing organization
  - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
  - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 4

Score:_____

- Paragraph summarizing a single study lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ number of patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a systematic review or meta-analysis lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ total number of included studies
  - _____ total number of included patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a diagnostic study (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
  - _____ description of testing protocol
  - _____ description of reference standard
  - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
  - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a practice guideline lacks:
  - _____ developing organization
  - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
  - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 5

Score:_____

- Paragraph summarizing a single study lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ number of patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a systematic review or meta-analysis lacks:
  - _____ research question/topic of the study
  - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
  - _____ total number of included studies
  - _____ total number of included patients
  - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
  - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
  - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)

  If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
  - _____ description of what is measured
  - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a diagnostic study (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
  - _____ description of testing protocol
  - _____ description of reference standard
  - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
  - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a practice guideline lacks:
  - _____ developing organization
  - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
  - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Section 3: Tables page 14

Manuscript will be rejected for two (2) or more infractions in this section

Score:_____

- Any tables lack:
  - _____ stand-alone title
  - _____ reference citation numbers
  - _____ minimal number clutter in cells (only 1 or 2 numbers in each cell)

COMMENTS: