



In order to be accepted into the publication process, all HDAs must meet minimum standards.

Unfortunately, this manuscript did not pass the initial review.

This is part of FPIN's Reject & Resubmit Once policy. Authors will only have one opportunity to submit their revisions for these specific issues to the editorial office for a second review. Authors will have three (3) weeks to revise their manuscript. If you need additional time, please see FPIN's [Due Date Extension Policy](#).

EMS Number: _____

Question: _____

Your Scores

Min. Score for Rejection

Format: _____

1 or more

Evidence Summary Total: _____

5 or more

Paragraph 1: _____

Paragraph 2: _____

Paragraph 3: _____

Paragraph 4: _____

Paragraph 5: _____

Table: _____

2 or more

Managing Editor Editorial Review – Checklist

Red superscript numbers refer to page numbers in the [HDA Author Guidebook](#) providing further information

Section 1: Format

Manuscript will be rejected for any **one** infraction on this page

Score: _____

- Manuscript does NOT meet technical standards:
 - _____ Author names in manuscript do not match names in EMS (Note: The Corresponding Author in the EMS is required to contribute to the writing of the manuscript. Local Editors who want to evaluate their program’s manuscripts within the EMS can apply for editing privileges in Feb 2019)
 - _____ Question in manuscript does not match the initial invitation or is absent from the document
 - _____ Manuscript not submitted as Word document [page 3](#)
- Reference section:
 - _____ Has only 1 reference or more than 5 references [page 5](#)
 - _____ References not numbered in order of appearance [page 10](#)
 - _____ Has no STEP level indicators [page 10](#)
 - _____ Included as ‘End Notes’ [page 10](#)
- Evidence Summary:
 - _____ More than one reference summarized in each paragraph (written in narrative review format) [page 5](#)
 - _____ Citation numbers not listed [page 5](#)
- Evidence Based Answer:
 - _____ No EBA
 - _____ EBA does not directly answer the question [page 4](#)
 - _____ No SOR indicators [page 4](#)
 - _____ Brief explanatory phrases missing from SOR indicators [page 4](#)

COMMENTS:

Section 2: Evidence Summary [pages 5-6](#) | [FPIN Institute Module](#)

Manuscript will be rejected for any **five (5)** infractions in this section

Paragraph 1

Score: _____

- Paragraph summarizing a **single study** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ number of patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **systematic review** or **meta-analysis** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ total number of included studies
 - _____ total number of included patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results with (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **diagnostic study** (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
 - _____ description of testing protocol
 - _____ description of reference standard
 - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
 - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a **practice guideline** lacks:
 - _____ developing organization
 - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
 - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 2

Score: _____

- Paragraph summarizing a **single study** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ number of patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **systematic review** or **meta-analysis** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ total number of included studies
 - _____ total number of included patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **diagnostic study** (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
 - _____ description of testing protocol
 - _____ description of reference standard
 - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
 - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a **practice guideline** lacks:
 - _____ developing organization
 - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
 - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 3, if applicable

Score: _____

- Paragraph summarizing a **single study** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ number of patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **systematic review** or **meta-analysis** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ total number of included studies
 - _____ total number of included patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **diagnostic study** (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
 - _____ description of testing protocol
 - _____ description of reference standard
 - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
 - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a **practice guideline** lacks:
 - _____ developing organization
 - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
 - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 4, if applicable

Score: _____

- Paragraph summarizing a **single study** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ number of patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **systematic review** or **meta-analysis** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ total number of included studies
 - _____ total number of included patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **diagnostic study** (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
 - _____ description of testing protocol
 - _____ description of reference standard
 - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
 - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a **practice guideline** lacks:
 - _____ developing organization
 - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
 - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Paragraph 5, if applicable

Score: _____

- Paragraph summarizing a **single study** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ study design (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ number of patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of intervention and comparator (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **systematic review** or **meta-analysis** lacks:
 - _____ research question/topic of the study
 - _____ design of included studies (RCT, cohort, etc.)
 - _____ total number of included studies
 - _____ total number of included patients
 - _____ patient demographics and/or description of included patients (diagnostic criteria, disease severity, etc.)
 - _____ description of interventions and comparators (treatment protocol, dose, route, frequency, duration, etc.)
 - _____ Numerical results (95% CI, P value, etc.)If outcomes are measured via outcome scales or scoring systems, the manuscript lacks:
 - _____ description of what is measured
 - _____ range of possible scores and indication of which end of range equals improvement

- Paragraph summarizing a **diagnostic study** (or meta-analysis of the same) lacks:
 - _____ description of testing protocol
 - _____ description of reference standard
 - _____ prevalence of the disease/condition
 - _____ numerical results (sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios, etc.)

- Paragraph summarizing a **practice guideline** lacks:
 - _____ developing organization
 - _____ development process (consensus or evidence-based)
 - _____ SOR or level/grade of evidence indicators

COMMENTS:

Section 3: Tables [page 10](#)

Manuscript will be rejected for **two (2)** or more infractions in this section

Score: _____

- Any tables lack: ¹⁰
 - _____ stand-alone title
 - _____ reference citation numbers
 - _____ minimal number clutter in cells (only 1 or 2 numbers in each cell)

COMMENTS: